



---

Spring 3-1-1996

## For the Civil Practitioner

Bonnie R. Gerhardt

*Washington and Lee University School of Law*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarlycommons.law.wlu.edu/wlulr>



Part of the [Courts Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Bonnie R. Gerhardt, *For the Civil Practitioner*, 53 Wash. & Lee L. Rev. 587 (1996).

Available at: <https://scholarlycommons.law.wlu.edu/wlulr/vol53/iss2/5>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Washington and Lee Law Review at Washington and Lee University School of Law Scholarly Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Washington and Lee Law Review by an authorized editor of Washington and Lee University School of Law Scholarly Commons. For more information, please contact [christensena@wlu.edu](mailto:christensena@wlu.edu).

# For the Civil Practitioner

## *A review of all 1995 civil, federal-question cases decided by the Fourth Circuit\**

### *Introductory Notes*

1. This is the fifth annual review of Fourth Circuit civil cases. Our past reviews covered only a portion of the Fourth Circuit's decisions but analyzed those decisions in some detail. This review covers all civil, federal-question cases decided by the United States Court of Appeals for the Fourth Circuit in 1995.

2. The cases have not been critically analyzed; rather each case has been summarized briefly to highlight the major points of law. Our aim is to direct the reader's attention to those cases which might be of interest to his or her practice.

### *Table of Contents*

I. Administrative Law . . . . .	596
<i>American Trucking Ass'n v. Federal Highway Administration</i> . . . . .	596
<i>EEOC v. City of Norfolk Police Department</i> . . . . .	597
<i>Fort Sumter Tours, Inc. v. Babbitt</i> . . . . .	598
II. Admiralty . . . . .	599
<i>Columbus-America Discovery Group v. Atlantic Mutual Insurance Co.</i> . . . . .	599
<i>Darlak v. Columbus-America Discovery Group</i> . . . . .	600
<i>Finora Co. v. Amitie Shipping, Ltd.</i> . . . . .	601

---

\* The Summaries included in this review were written by Bruce L. Benshoof, Krista R. Bowen, David C. Butow, John R. Dalton, Jr., Kathleen Flynn, Bonnie R. Gerhardt, Geoffrey J. Greeves, Francis M. Hamilton, III, Sean P. Leuba, Marc K. Matthews, Jeffrey P. Ouellet, Marcie E. Paduda, W. Brantley Phillips, Jr., Thomas K. Riley, Caprice L. Roberts, Michael A. Sackey, James S. SeEVERS, Jr., Douglas M. Walker, Matthew L. Weidner, and Christopher J. Yianilos.

	<i>Manuel v. United States</i> . . . . .	602
	<i>Maritrans Operating Partners, Ltd. v. The M/V</i>	
	<i>Balsa 37</i> . . . . .	602
	<i>Servis v. Hiller Systems, Inc.</i> . . . . .	603
	<i>South Carolina State Ports Authority v. M/V Tyson</i>	
	<i>Lykes</i> . . . . .	604
	<i>Vodusek v. Bayliner Marine Corp.</i> . . . . .	605
	<i>White v. United States</i> . . . . .	606
III.	Bankruptcy . . . . .	606
	A. Generally . . . . .	606
	<i>Ballard v. United States (In re Ballard)</i> . . . . .	606
	<i>In re Bulldog Trucking, Inc.</i> . . . . .	607
	<i>Citizens Bank v. Broyles (In re Broyles)</i> . . . . .	608
	<i>FDIC v. Prince George Corp.</i> . . . . .	609
	<i>Stewart Foods, Inc. v. Broecker</i> . . . . .	610
	B. Definition of Disposable Income . . . . .	611
	<i>Solomon v. Cosby (In re Solomon)</i> . . . . .	611
	C. Discharge of Debts . . . . .	612
	<i>Butler v. NationsBank</i> . . . . .	612
	<i>First National Bank v. Stanley (In re Stanley)</i> . . . . .	613
	<i>Hagen v. McNallen (In re McNallen)</i> . . . . .	613
	D. Rules of Procedure . . . . .	614
	<i>Legal Representative for Future Claimants v.</i>	
	<i>Aetna Casualty &amp; Surety Co. (In re Wallace &amp;</i>	
	<i>Gale Co.)</i> . . . . .	614
	<i>Resolution Trust Corp. v. SPR Corp.</i> . . . . .	615
IV.	Business Law/Commercial Transactions . . . . .	616
	A. Antitrust . . . . .	616
	<i>Thompson Everett, Inc. v. National Cable</i>	
	<i>Advertising</i> . . . . .	616
	B. Banking . . . . .	617
	<i>Donmar Enterprises v. Southern National Bank</i> . . . . .	617
	C. Fair Debt Collection Practices Act . . . . .	618
	<i>Carroll v. Wolpoff &amp; Abramson</i> . . . . .	618
	D. Federal Deposit Insurance Corporations . . . . .	618
	<i>Doolin Security Savings Bank, F.S.B. v. FDIC</i> . . . . .	618
	E. Government Collection of Judgment Liens (Federal Debt	
	Collection Act/Statutes of Limitation) . . . . .	619
	<i>United States v. Little</i> . . . . .	619

F.	Interstate Land Sales Full Disclosure Act . . . . .	620
	<i>HUD v. Cost Control Marketing &amp; Sales</i> <i>Management of Virginia, Inc.</i> . . . . .	620
V.	Calculations in Condemnation Proceeding . . . . .	622
	<i>United States v. Banisadr Building Joint Venture</i> . . . . .	622
VI.	Civil Damages Under RICO . . . . .	622
	<i>Bast v. Cohen, Dunn &amp; Sinclair, P.C.</i> . . . . .	622
VII.	Civil Rights . . . . .	623
	A. Employment Discrimination . . . . .	623
	<i>Dennis v. County of Fairfax</i> . . . . .	623
	B. Section 1981 . . . . .	624
	<i>Theard v. Glaxo, Inc.</i> . . . . .	624
	C. Section 1983 . . . . .	625
	1. Absolute Immunity . . . . .	625
	<i>Alexander v. Holden</i> . . . . .	625
	<i>Berkley v. Common Council</i> . . . . .	626
	2. Attorney's Fees (Section 1988) . . . . .	626
	<i>Trimper v. City of Norfolk</i> . . . . .	626
	3. Excessive Force . . . . .	627
	<i>Sturges v. Matthews</i> . . . . .	627
	4. Pleading . . . . .	628
	<i>Biggs v. Meadows</i> . . . . .	628
	5. Qualified Immunity . . . . .	629
	<i>Buonocore v. Harris</i> . . . . .	629
	<i>DiMeglio v. Haines</i> . . . . .	630
	<i>Pinder v. Johnson</i> . . . . .	631
	<i>Price v. Sasser</i> . . . . .	632
	6. State Action/Meaning of "Person" . . . . .	632
	<i>Greensboro Professional Fire Fighters Ass'n,</i> <i>Local 3157 v. City of Greensboro</i> . . . . .	632
	<i>UAW v. Gaston Festivals, Inc.</i> . . . . .	633
	D. Eleventh Amendment . . . . .	634
	<i>Gray v. Laws</i> . . . . .	634
	<i>Ristow v. South Carolina Ports Authority</i> . . . . .	635
VIII.	Constitutional Law . . . . .	636
	A. Commerce Clause . . . . .	636
	<i>WLR Foods, Inc. v. Tyson Foods, Inc.</i> . . . . .	636

B.	Contracts Clause . . . . .	637
	<i>City of Charleston v. Public Service Commission</i> . . . . .	637
	<i>Kestler v. Board of Trustees of North Carolina</i> <i>Local Governmental Employees'</i> <i>Retirement System</i> . . . . .	639
C.	Full Faith and Credit/Supremacy Clause . . . . .	639
	<i>Swanson v. Faulkner</i> . . . . .	639
D.	First Amendment . . . . .	640
	1. Religion . . . . .	640
	<i>Barghout v. Bureau of Kosher Meat &amp; Food</i> <i>Control</i> . . . . .	640
	<i>Goodall v. Stafford County School Board</i> . . . . .	641
	2. Speech and Expression . . . . .	642
	a. Commercial Speech . . . . .	642
	<i>Anheuser-Busch, Inc. v. Schmoke</i> . . . . .	642
	<i>Penn Advertising of Baltimore, Inc.</i> <i>v. Mayor of Baltimore</i> . . . . .	644
	b. Freedom of Access to Clinic Entrances Act of 1994 . . . . .	646
	<i>American Life League, Inc. v. Reno</i> . . . . .	646
	<i>Woodall v. Reno</i> . . . . .	646
	c. Prior Restraint . . . . .	647
	<i>11126 Baltimore Boulevard, Inc. v. Prince</i> <i>George's County, Maryland</i> . . . . .	647
	<i>Chesapeake B&amp;M, Inc. v. Harford</i> <i>County, Maryland</i> . . . . .	648
	d. Generally . . . . .	650
	<i>Gilles v. Torgersen</i> . . . . .	650
E.	Second Amendment . . . . .	650
	<i>Love v. Pepersack</i> . . . . .	650
F.	Fourth Amendment . . . . .	651
	1. Electronic Communications Privacy Act of 1986 . . . . .	651
	<i>Brown v. Waddell</i> . . . . .	651
	2. Probable Cause/Warrant Clause . . . . .	652
	<i>Simmons v. Poe</i> . . . . .	652
G.	Fifth Amendment . . . . .	653
	1. Due Process . . . . .	653
	<i>Shadburne-Vinton v. Dalkon Shield Claimants</i> <i>Trust</i> . . . . .	653
	2. Self-Incrimination . . . . .	654
	<i>Wiley v. Mayor of Baltimore</i> . . . . .	654

H.	Fourteenth Amendment	655
1.	Due Process	655
	<i>Corns v. Russell County Virginia School Board</i>	655
	<i>Garraghty v. Virginia Department of     Corrections</i>	655
	<i>Pink v. Lester</i>	656
	<i>Waters v. Gaston County</i>	658
2.	Equal Protection	659
	<i>Faulkner v. Jones</i>	659
	<i>Jones v. Plaster</i>	660
	<i>McLaughlin v. North Carolina Board of     Elections</i>	660
	<i>United States v. Virginia</i>	663
3.	Due Process and Equal Protection	664
	<i>Sylvia Development Corp. v. Calvert County</i>	664
IX.	Environmental Law	665
A.	Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (CERCLA)	665
	<i>Westfarm Associates Ltd. Partnership     v. Washington Suburban Sanitary Commission</i>	665
B.	Constitutional Challenges	668
	<i>Chambers Medical Technologies, Inc. v. Bryant</i>	668
C.	Spence Amendment to National Defense Authorization Act of 1994	669
	<i>South Carolina ex rel. Campbell v. O'Leary</i>	669
X.	Federal Practice and Procedure	671
A.	Federal Arbitration Act	671
	<i>CNF Constructors, Inc. v. Donohoe Construction     Co.</i>	671
	<i>Consolidation Coal Co. v. Local 1643, United     Mine Workers</i>	671
B.	Federal Rules of Evidence	672
	<i>Benedi v. McNeil-P.P.C., Inc.</i>	672
C.	Fraudulent Concealment Tolling	673
	<i>Supermarket of Marlinton, Inc. v. Meadow Gold     Dairies, Inc.</i>	673
D.	<i>In Forma Pauperis</i> Action	674
	<i>Nasim v. Warden, Maryland House of Correction</i>	674
E.	Judicial Review	674
	<i>Finelli v. Tabb</i>	674

F. Jurisdiction	675
1. Diversity	675
<i>Fairfax County Redevelopment &amp; Housing Authority v. W.M. Schlosser Co.</i>	675
<i>United States Fidelity &amp; Guaranty Co. v. A&amp;S Manufacturing Co.</i>	676
2. Erie Doctrine	676
<i>Hottle v. Beech Aircraft Corp.</i>	676
3. Removal	677
<i>Arthur v. E.I. DuPont de Nemours &amp; Co.</i>	677
<i>Davis v. North Carolina Department of Correction</i>	678
4. Generally	679
<i>Carolina Power &amp; Light Co. v. Department of Labor</i>	679
<i>Pittston Coal Co. v. Babbitt</i>	680
<i>United States v. J&amp;E Salvage Co.</i>	681
G. Preemption	681
1. ERISA	681
<i>Employers Resource Management Co. v. Shannon</i>	681
2. Federal Food, Drug and Cosmetic Act	682
<i>Duvall v. Bristol-Myers-Squibb Co.</i>	682
3. Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act	683
<i>Lowe v. Sporicidin International</i>	683
4. Maritime Law	684
<i>Maryland Department of Natural Resources v. Kellum</i>	684
H. Rules of Procedure	685
<i>Camacho v. Mancuso</i>	685
<i>Hathcock v. Navistar International Transportation Corp.</i>	686
<i>Mendez v. Elliot</i>	687
<i>National Organization for Women v. Operation Rescue</i>	688
XI. Federal Tort Claims Act	689
<i>Kerstetter v. United States</i>	689
<i>Perkins v. United States</i>	690
<i>Williams v. United States</i>	691

XII.	Freedom of Information Act . . . . .	691
	A. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies . . . . .	691
	<i>Pollack v. Department of Justice</i> . . . . .	691
XIII.	Health and Welfare . . . . .	692
	A. Civilian Health and Medical Programs of the Uniformed Services (CHAMPUS) . . . . .	692
	<i>Wilson v. Office of Civilian Health &amp; Medical     Programs of the Uniformed Services     (CHAMPUS)</i> . . . . .	692
	B. ERISA . . . . .	693
	<i>Bailey v. Blue Cross &amp; Blue Shield</i> . . . . .	693
	<i>Hardester v. Lincoln National Life Insurance Co.</i> . . . .	694
	<i>Wheeler v. Dynamic Engineering, Inc.</i> . . . . .	695
	C. Food Stamp Act . . . . .	696
	<i>Warren v. North Carolina Department of Human     Resources, Division of Social Services</i> . . . . .	696
	D. Social Security Disability Benefits . . . . .	696
	<i>Bailey v. Chater</i> . . . . .	696
	<i>Hall v. Chater</i> . . . . .	697
	E. Standard of Review (Denial of Health Benefits) . . . . .	698
	<i>Bernstein v. CapitalCare, Inc.</i> . . . . .	698
XIV.	Immigration . . . . .	699
	A. Board of Immigration Appeals . . . . .	699
	<i>Gandarillas-Zambrana v. Board of Immigration     Appeals</i> . . . . .	699
	B. Crimes of Moral Turpitude . . . . .	700
	<i>Akindemowo v. INS</i> . . . . .	700
	C. Dangerousness Determinations . . . . .	701
	<i>Kofa v. INS</i> . . . . .	701
	D. Immigration and Nationality Act . . . . .	702
	<i>Chen Zhou Chai v. Carroll</i> . . . . .	702
XV.	Labor and Employment Law . . . . .	703
	A. Age Discrimination in Employment Act . . . . .	703
	<i>Henson v. Liggett Group, Inc.</i> . . . . .	703
	<i>O'Connor v. Consolidated Coin Caterers Corp.</i> . . . .	704
	B. Americans with Disabilities Act . . . . .	706
	<i>Doe v. University of Maryland Medical System     Corp.</i> . . . . .	706



	<i>Ennis v. National Ass'n of Business &amp; Educational Radio, Inc.</i> . . . . .	706
	<i>Myers v. Hose</i> . . . . .	707
C.	Back Pay Act . . . . .	708
	<i>Woolf v. Bowles</i> . . . . .	708
D.	Black Lung Benefits Act . . . . .	709
	<i>Barber v. Director, Office of Workers' Compensation Programs</i> . . . . .	709
	<i>Curry v. Beatrice Pocahontas Coal Co.</i> . . . . .	710
	<i>Dehue Coal Co. v. Ballard</i> . . . . .	711
	<i>Director, Office of Workers' Compensation Programs v. Trace Fork Coal Co.</i> . . . . .	712
	<i>Doss v. Director, Office of Workers' Compensation Programs</i> . . . . .	713
	<i>Hobbs v. Clinchfield Coal Co.</i> . . . . .	713
	<i>Scott v. Mason Coal Co.</i> . . . . .	714
	<i>Sea "B" Mining Co. v. Director, Office of Workers' Compensation Programs</i> . . . . .	715
	<i>Toler v. Eastern Associated Coal Co.</i> . . . . .	716
	<i>Warth v. Southern Ohio Coal Co.</i> . . . . .	717
E.	Civil Rights Act of 1991 . . . . .	717
	<i>Fuller v. Phipps</i> . . . . .	717
F.	Equal Pay Act . . . . .	718
	<i>Strag v. Board of Trustees</i> . . . . .	718
G.	ERISA . . . . .	720
	<i>Employers Resource Management Co. v. James</i> . . . . .	720
	<i>Fagan v. National Stabilization Agreement of Sheet Metal Industry Trust Fund</i> . . . . .	721
H.	Fair Labor Standards Act . . . . .	722
	<i>Hennessey v. Department of Defense</i> . . . . .	722
	<i>Reich v. Southern Maryland Hospital, Inc.</i> . . . . .	722
I.	Hatch Political Activity Act . . . . .	723
	<i>Sidwell v. Express Container Services, Inc.</i> . . . . .	723
	<i>Williams v. United States Merit Systems Protection Board</i> . . . . .	724
J.	Longshore and Harbor Workers' Act . . . . .	725
	<i>National Metal &amp; Steel Corp. v. Reich</i> . . . . .	725
K.	National Labor Relations Act . . . . .	726
	1. Bargaining . . . . .	726
	<i>AMF Bowling Co. v. NLRB</i> . . . . .	726
	<i>ARA Services, Inc. v. NLRB</i> . . . . .	727

	<i>NLRB v. Lundy Packing Co.</i> . . . . .	728
	<i>NLRB v. Williams Enterprises, Inc.</i> . . . . .	729
2.	Definition of Employee . . . . .	731
	<i>Holly Farms Corp. v. NLRB</i> . . . . .	731
3.	Joint and Several Liability for Unfair Labor Practices . . . . .	732
	<i>Vance v. NLRB</i> . . . . .	732
4.	Propriety of Dismissal/Amendment of Complaint . . .	733
	<i>FPC Holdings, Inc. v. NLRB</i> . . . . .	733
5.	Term in Collective Bargaining Agreement . . . . .	734
	<i>Bonnell/Tredegan Industries, Inc. v. NLRB</i> . . . . .	734
	<i>General Drivers, Warehousemen &amp; Helpers</i> <i>Local Union No. 509 v. Ethyl Corp.</i> . . . . .	734
L.	Supplemental Security Income . . . . .	735
	<i>Pass v. Chater</i> . . . . .	735
M.	Title VII . . . . .	736
	<i>Amirmokri v. Baltimore Gas &amp; Electric Co.</i> . . . . .	736
	<i>Martin v. Cavalier Hotel Corp.</i> . . . . .	737
	<i>Robinson v. Shell Oil Co.</i> . . . . .	738
	<i>Russell v. Microdyne Corp.</i> . . . . .	738
	<i>Smith v. Virginia Commonwealth University</i> . . . . .	740
	<i>Spicer v. Virginia Department of Corrections</i> . . . . .	741
N.	Employment Discrimination Generally . . . . .	742
	<i>Hickey v. Digital Equipment Corp.</i> . . . . .	742
	<i>Hughes v. Bedsole</i> . . . . .	743
	<i>Jiminez v. Mary Washington College</i> . . . . .	744
XVI.	Taxation . . . . .	745
A.	Constitutional Issues (Double Jeopardy and Excessive Fines) . . . . .	745
	<i>Thomas v. Commissioner</i> . . . . .	745
B.	Deductions . . . . .	746
	<i>Weber v. Commissioner</i> . . . . .	746
C.	Estate Tax . . . . .	747
	<i>Estate of Carpenter v. Commissioner</i> . . . . .	747
	<i>Estate of Waters v. Commissioner</i> . . . . .	748
D.	Levy by IRS . . . . .	749
	<i>United States v. Jefferson-Pilot Life Insurance Co.</i> . .	749
E.	Statute of Limitations . . . . .	749
	<i>Lundy v. IRS</i> . . . . .	749
	<i>Webb v. United States</i> . . . . .	750